

Dr. Zoë Harcombe PhD Papers – Summary

Paper	RCTs Then (1)	RCTs Now (2)	Prospective Cohorts Then (3)	Prospective Cohorts Now (4)
Type	Sys Rev & Meta-Analysis	Sys Rev & Meta-Analysis	Sys Rev (M-A not possible)	Sys Rev & Meta-Analysis
Focus	Dietary fat, serum cholesterol, CHD mortality, all-cause mortality	Dietary fat, serum cholesterol, CHD mortality, all-cause mortality	Dietary fat (total & saturated), serum cholesterol, CHD mortality	Dietary fat (total & saturated), serum cholesterol, CHD mortality
Number of studies: type	6: 5 secondary prevention; 1 combined	10: 7 secondary prevention; 1 primary prevention & 2 combined	6: 1 combined; 5 primary prevention	7: 1 secondary prevention; 6 primary prevention
Participants	2,467 men	62,421 mixed (86% women)	31,445 men	89,801 mixed (94% men)
Key findings: Dietary fat & CHD	No sig diff in all-cause mortality No sig diff in CHD mortality	No sig diff in all-cause mortality No sig diff in CHD mortality	0/6 studies association between total fat & CHD mortality 1/6 studies association between sat fat & CHD mortality	No sig diff in total fat & CHD mortality No sig diff in sat fat & CHD mortality
Cholesterol	Reductions in mean chol sig higher in intervention groups; made no difference	Reductions in mean chol sig higher in intervention groups; made no difference	1/6 studies found association between mean chol & CHD. Another 1/6 found association between median chol & CHD	1 study found association between baseline chol & CHD mortality in 30-59 age group, not 60-79
Did study examine 30% total fat and/or 10% sat fat?	None examined either	Strictly none. One got close (5): study of 55 people examined 27% cal fat (8-10% sat; 8% poly)	None examined either	None examined either
Evidence for either dietary fat guideline?	None pooled or individually	None pooled. STARS (5) claimed result, but not supported by evidence	1 inter-country study found association between sat fat & CHD	None pooled. 1/10 (6) found sig. diff. for total & sat fat. 1/10 (7) found sig. <i>inverse</i> diff. with sat fat. 3/10 found sig. diff. with sub groups (8-10)
Additional findings?	Results non generalisable	Results non generalisable	Results non generalisable	Results non generalisable

References

1. Harcombe Z, Baker JS, Cooper SM, Davies B, Sculthorpe N, DiNicolantonio JJ, et al. Evidence from randomised controlled trials did not support the introduction of dietary fat guidelines in 1977 and 1983: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Open Heart*. 2015;2(1).
2. Harcombe Z, Baker JS, DiNicolantonio JJ, Grace F, Davies B. Evidence from randomised controlled trials does not support current dietary fat guidelines: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Open Heart*. 2016;3(2).
3. Harcombe Z, Baker JS, Davies B. Evidence from prospective cohort studies did not support the introduction of dietary fat guidelines in 1977 and 1983: a systematic review. *Br J Sports Med*. 2016.
4. Harcombe Z, Baker J, Davies B. Evidence from prospective cohort studies does not support current dietary fat guidelines: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Br J Sports Med*. 2016 (In submission).
5. Watts GF, Lewis B, Brunt JN, Lewis ES, Coltart DJ, Smith LD, et al. Effects on coronary artery disease of lipid-lowering diet, or diet plus cholestyramine, in the St Thomas' Atherosclerosis Regression Study (STARS). *The Lancet*. 1992;339(8793):563-9.
6. Ascherio A, Rimm EB, Giovannucci EL, Spiegelman D, Meir S, Willett WC. Dietary fat and risk of coronary heart disease in men: cohort follow up study in the United States. *BMJ*. 1996;313(7049):84-90.
7. Pietinen P, Ascherio A, Korhonen P, Hartman AM, Willett WC, Albanes D, et al. Intake of Fatty Acids and Risk of Coronary Heart Disease in a Cohort of Finnish Men: The Alpha-Tocopherol, Beta-Carotene Cancer Prevention Study. *Am J Epidemiol*. 1997;145(10):876-87.
8. Boniface DR, Tefft ME. Dietary fats and 16-year coronary heart disease mortality in a cohort of men and women in Great Britain. *Eur J Clin Nutr*. 2002;56(8):786-92.
9. Xu J, Eilat-Adar S, Loria C, Goldbourt U, Howard BV, Fabsitz RR, et al. Dietary fat intake and risk of coronary heart disease: the Strong Heart Study. *The American journal of clinical nutrition*. 2006;84(4):894-902.
10. Esrey KL, Joseph L, Grover SA. Relationship between dietary intake and coronary heart disease mortality: Lipid Research Clinics Prevalence Follow-Up Study. *J Clin Epidemiol*. 1996;49(2):211-6.